PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING IN THE EAST OF UKRAINE – INTEGRATION FOR DEVELOPMENT
PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING IN THE EAST OF UKRAINE – INTEGRATION FOR DEVELOPMENT

The project for support of the implementation and development of the Participatory Budgeting in 5 cities and 5 amalgamated territorial communities in Zaporizka, Dnipropetrovska and Kharkivska oblasts.

5 cities:
- Kryvyi Rih
- Kamyanske
- Melitopol
- Chuguiv
- Pervomaiskyy

5 ATCs:
- Prymorska ATC
- Chernihivska ATC
- Tomakivska ATC
- Shyrokovska ATC
- Novovodolazka ATC

Project goal – to initiate the implementation and to improve Participatory Budgeting in cities and ATCs.

The project was implemented by PAUCI, Polish-Ukrainian Cooperation Foundation within the framework of the Project “Strengthening Ukrainian Communities Hosting Internally Displaced Persons”, one of the Initiatives for the Infrastructure Program for Ukraine implemented by Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ GmbH) commissioned by the Government of Germany.
Content

Stages of participatory budgeting.................................................................4
Fundamental principles of the PB...............................................................5
About the Project Participatory Budgeting in the East of Ukraine...............................6
Cases of participatory budgeting...............................................................12
  Kryvyi Rih .......................................................................................14
  Kamyanske .....................................................................................16
  Melitopol...........................................................................................18
  Chuguiv...............................................................................................20
  Pervomaiskyy.....................................................................................22
  Prymorskaya ATC............................................................................24
  Chernihivska ATC............................................................................26
  Tomakivska ATC...............................................................................28
  Shyrokovska ATC............................................................................30
  Novovodolazka ATC.........................................................................32
Project experts..........................................................................................35
Local coordinators of Participatory Budgeting............................................38
Stages of participatory budgeting

- Preparation stage ("phase zero")
- Development of process provisions and principles
- Awareness-raising campaign
- Project preparation and submission
- Discussion of projects
- Project verification
- Selection of projects for further implementation
- Monitoring of project implementation
- Evaluation Process
Participatory Budgeting is a democratic process, in which:

- citizens develop and offer to authorities their projects
- citizens make their own decision which exactly projects will be implemented
- the task of governmental authorities – to implement projects, chosen by the citizens
- participation of community facilitates taking into consideration the needs of various social groups, as well as residents of various territories.

**Fundamental principles of the Participatory Budgeting**

- The results are obligatory for implementation
- Transparency and openness
- Inclusiveness
- Provision of meeting-places for hearings (debates) with the citizens
- Support of citizens' proactive attitude
- Strategic perspective thinking
Participatory Budgeting in the East of Ukraine – Integration for Development
Who implements the project and what is the project duration?

The project was implemented by a group of PAUCI experts within the framework of the Project “Strengthening Ukrainian Communities Hosting Internally Displaced Persons”, one of the Initiatives for the Infrastructure Program for Ukraine implemented by Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ GmbH) commissioned by the Government of Germany from January 2018 till June 2019.

Which support was provided to cities and communities within the framework of the project?

Around 100 events were conducted: trainings, workshops, forums and consulting meetings on the issues of implementation and development of Participatory Budgeting. More than 2.5 thousand communities residents took part in these events. Also, a financial support was provided for informational campaign conduction. The main subject of the trainings: key stages and principles of participatory budget, preparation and implementation of the participatory budgeting procedure at all stages, moderation of events, preparation of projects, evaluation and improvement of the procedure.
Which main data are indicative of positive dynamics and effectiveness of the project?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage Change</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>2017 Value</th>
<th>2018 Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>+63%</td>
<td>Financing of participatory budgeting</td>
<td>18.46 million UAH</td>
<td>30.12 million UAH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>+80%</td>
<td>Number of submitted projects</td>
<td>281 projects</td>
<td>508 projects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>+67%</td>
<td>Number of chosen projects to be implemented</td>
<td>80 projects</td>
<td>140 projects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>+50%</td>
<td>Number of residents, who gave their votes</td>
<td>77,877</td>
<td>155,413</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What are subject matters of the projects submitted by the residents in the cities and ATCs?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject Matter</th>
<th>5 Cities</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>5 ATCs</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Medicine</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sports</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture and tourism</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy efficiency</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social protection</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pedestrian areas and embankments</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What are the project results for various stakeholders?

**Local government**

- additional financial resources for the promotion of the PB
- knowledge on participation, facilitation
- events moderation skills
- conflict prevention and resolution mechanism between the citizens and local government authorities
- development of a dialogue form of cooperation

**Local residents**

- awareness of participation in local budgeting
- awareness of the structure of local governmental authorities
- senior pupils became more active
NGOs

engagement in the PB working groups
increasing influence in decision making process

Internally displaced persons

got new instrument to participate in public life
participation in working groups on implementation of the Participatory Budgeting
opportunity to submit projects and to vote
Cases of participatory budgeting

5 cities
5 ATCs
KRYVYI RIH (DNIPROPETROVSKA OBLAST)

Population 632,422
City area 430 km²

Total city budget 6,701 million UAH

Total sum allocated for participatory budgeting
in 2016 and 2017 15 million UAH
in 2018 21 million UAH
in 2019 26 million UAH

14
A sector of Participatory Budgeting was created in the department of economics.

The sum for Participatory Budgeting project was increased from 15 million UAH in 2017 to 21 million UAH in 2018.

The procedure of approval of projects by district councils before the submission was canceled.

The sum of co-financing of projects for NGOs was decreased from 25% to 15%, for individual residents – from 10% to 5%. For persons under 18 years of age, co-financing is not required.

New types of projects were formed out: educational, municipal and youth.
KAMYANSKE
(DNIPROPETROVSKA OBLAST)

Population
241,990

City area
138 km²

Total city budget
2,450 million UAH

Total sum allocated for participatory budgeting
2018 2.5 million UAH

number of projects, admitted to voting
2018 60

number of persons, who gave their votes
2018 3868

number of projects, that received funding
2018 15

number of projects, submitted by IDPs
2018 0

number of projects, admitted to voting
2018 60

number of persons, who gave their votes
2018 3868

number of projects, that received funding
2018 15

number of projects, submitted by IDPs
2018 0
Achievements:

The quality of projects submitted by residents increases. Thus, in 2018, positive conclusion as a result of evaluation was given to 60 projects; in 2019 – to 104 projects (with the same total number of submitted projects).

Coordination Board of the Participatory Budgeting included a representative of IDP NGO.

Number of persons, who gave their votes for the PB projects increased 5 times: from 3858 persons in 2018 to 20 800 persons in 2019.
MELITOPOL
(ZAPORIZKA OBLAST)

Population
153 992

City area
49.66 km²

Total city budget
1 285 million UAH

Total sum allocated for participatory budgeting
in 2017
2.6 million UAH
in 2018
3 million UAH

- number of projects, admitted to voting
- number of projects that received funding
- number of persons, who gave their votes
- number of projects, submitted by IDPs
Project spheres:

- Culture and education: 20
- Safety and public order: 2
- Energy efficiency: 8
- Public utility and infrastructure projects: 34
- Sports: 25
- Environment: 4
- Other: 9
- Social protection: 4

Submitted projects: 106

90 projects were submitted in 2017

Achievements:

- Working group on evaluation of the Participatory Budgeting was created and included a representative of IDP NGO. Evaluation methodology was developed.
- Number of residents, who voted for projects, increased by 25%.
- New version of Regulation on participatory budgeting was approved.
- Expenditures for the Participatory Budgeting increased from 3 million UAH to 3 million 300 thousand UAH.
CHUGUIV (KHARKIVSKA OBLAST)

Population **33 104**

City area **12.77 km²**

Total city budget **357 million UAH**

Total sum allocated for participatory budgeting in 2017 **360 000 UAH**

in 2018 **4 200 000 UAH**

- **7** (2017) number of persons, who gave their votes
- **20** (2017) number of projects, admitted to voting
- **1450** (2017) number of projects submitted by IDPs
- **7** (2017) number of projects, that received funding
- **5** (2018) number of projects, that received funding
- **1** (2018) number of projects, that received funding

**KHARKIV**

**Dnipro**

**Chuguiv**
Citizens aged 14 and above has a right to submit projects and to give their votes.

Number of signatures required for supporting a project was decreased from 50 to 15.

The competencies of the working group on the Participatory Budgeting were established.

The sum for participatory budgeting increased from 320 thousand UAH to 800 thousand UAH.

Maximum cost of a small project increased from 50 thousand UAH to 60 thousand UAH.

Maximum cost of a big project increased from 80 thousand UAH to 100 thousand UAH.

Achievements:

12 projects were submitted in 2017
PERVOMAISKYY
(KHARKIVSKA OBLAST)

Population
29 931

City area
9 km²

Total city budget
270.5 million UAH

Total sum allocated for participatory budgeting
in 2017 100 000 UAH
in 2018 200 000 UAH

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2017</th>
<th>2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>number of projects, admitted to voting</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>number of projects that received funding</td>
<td>385</td>
<td>903</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>number of persons, who gave their votes</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>number of projects, submitted by IDPs</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Regulation as supplemented with a clause, allowing the project author to improve his/her application after the submission.

Most projects were submitted by senior pupils of secondary schools of the city.

Total amount of the Participatory Budgeting was increased from 100 thousand UAH to 200 thousand UAH.

Maximum cost of a project increased from 20 thousand UAH to 40 thousand UAH.
PRYMORSKA ATC (ZAPORIZKA OBLAST)

Community area 230 km²

Community population 15,131

Total community budget 91.6 million UAH

Total sum allocated for participatory budgeting in 2018 400,000 UAH

Number of projects, admitted to voting: 26

Number of persons, who gave their votes: 1,455

Number of projects that received funding: 8

Number of projects, submitted by IDPs: 6
Achievements:

Cancellation of obligatory co-financing by project authors.

Increase in number of projects submitted by IDPs by 100% in comparison with previous stage (20% of total number of submitted projects).

Strengthening of engagement of NGOs in informational campaign arrangements.

"Participatory Budgeting" program was created on TV-channel Prymorsk 24.
CHERNIHIVSKA ATC (ZAPORIZKA OBLAST)

Community population
16 822

Community area
1200 km²

Total community budget
145.9 million UAH

Total sum allocated for participatory budgeting in 2018
500 000 UAH

- Number of projects, admitted to voting: 13 (2018), 342 (2018)
- Number of projects that received funding: 12 (2018), 1 (2018)
- Number of persons, who gave their votes: 201 (2018), 181 (2018)
- Number of projects submitted by IDPs: 12 (2018), 1 (2018)
Money intended for participatory budgeting was divided in equal parts among Starosta Districts and Administrative Center of the community.

Age limit for participation in the Participatory Budgeting (authorship, support, voting) was shifted from 16 to 14 years in the second year of the PB.

The procedure for open voting for project in each Starosta Districts was implemented.

9 of 11 Starosts took part in the process of implementation of the Participatory Budgeting.
Tomakivska ATC
(Dnipropetrovsk Oblast)

Community population
14,826

Community area
623.8 km²

Total community budget
107.4 million UAH

Total sum allocated for participatory budgeting in 2018
300,000 UAH

Number of projects admitted to voting
2018: 7
2018: 358

Number of persons who gave their votes
2018: 18
2018: 18

Number of projects that received funding
2018: 4
2018: 0

Number of projects submitted by IDPs
2018: 2
2018: 0
11 projects from ATCs residents were submitted to the PB, 6 of them are projects, defined as prioritized during public hearings in each Starosta District.

In urban type village Tomakivka, the winner was chosen by direct voting.
SHYROKIVSKA ATC (ZAPORIZKA OBLAST)

Community population
13 000

Community area
378.3 km²

Total community budget
73 million UAH

Total sum allocated for participatory budgeting
in 2018 300 000 UAH

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Projects Admitted to Voting</th>
<th>Projects Funded</th>
<th>Voters</th>
<th>Projects Submitted by IDPs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2018</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2014</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Amendments were introduced to the Regulation (the PB participant shall be 14 years old and above, sum limit for project – UAH 50 000).

Engagement of Starostas, neighborhood committees, moderators in promotion of the PB.

24 projects were submitted (considering that this ATC is the smallest in the project).

Almost 15% of residents gave their votes.

Engagement of starostas, neighbourhood committees, moderators in promotion of the PB.

3 projects, that were submitted but did not receive the financing within participatory budgeting, were implemented.

Case of a success due to social cohesion: in some settlement, 6 projects were submitted. At general public meeting, residents laid out priorities and united behind 2 projects, which further got the financing within participatory budgeting.
NOVOVODOLAZKA ATC (KHARKIVSKA OBLAST)

Community population
18 996

Community area
351.6 km²

Total community budget
160 million UAH

Total sum allocated for participatory budgeting in 2018
1.5 million UAH

- Number of projects, admitted to voting: 32 (2018), 1428 (2018)
- Number of projects that received funding: 11 (2018), 0 (2018)
- Number of persons, who gave their votes: 32
- Number of projects, submitted by IDPs: 2
The sum, released for the financing of the PB projects, was tripled: from 500 to 1,500,000 UAH.

Starostas' offices are functioning as PB consulting centers.
Project experts
Kostiantyn Ploskyy
project director
pauci kp@gmail.com

Leonid Donos
project chief expert
ldonos81@gmail.com

Yevhen Perevezentsev
project expert
edinakraina@gmail.com

Roman Nikitenko
project manager
pauci rn@gmail.com

Roman Shyrokykh
project expert
delante sr pl@gmail.com
Liudmyla Protsenko
project expert
protsen.lyudmila@gmail.com

Nataliya Vynnychenko
project expert
Vinnichenkonataliia@gmail.com

Anna Nikolenko-Bayeva
project expert
demokrat_rozvitok@ukr.net

Pavlo Kozelets'kyi
events facilitator
kozeleckij@gmail.com

Iryna Stasyuk
project expert
babchuk.irina@gmail.com
Krzysztof Filcek
international project expert, Poland
kf@pauci.pl

Mikhaeli Aslikyan
international project expert, Georgia
m.aslikyan@gmail.com

Dariusz Kraszewski
international project expert, Poland
dkraszewski@maszglos.p

Przemysław Gurski
international project expert, Poland
przemek.gorski@topografie.pl

Andriy Nikolov
international facilitation expert
nikolov@europe.com
Local coordinators of Participatory Budgeting

Nadiya Devyatyrkova
Prymorska ATC
mrprim@ukr.net

Tetyana Krasilnikova
Chuguiv
info@chuguev-rada.gov.ua

Kateryna Maltseva
Shyrokovska ATC
shyroke.otg@gmail.com

Tetyana Pidpalko
Kryvyi Rih
gb.kr.city@gmail.com
More information on Participatory Budgeting

Publications, articles, analytics
pauci.org/ua/publications

Exchange of best practices and new contacts
www.fb.com/groups/pbtime/

Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH

Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ GmbH)
Main offices in Bonn and Eschborn, Germany
Initiatives for the Infrastructure Program for Ukraine
Project “Strengthening Ukrainian Communities Hosted Internally Displaced Persons”

26 Lesi Ukrainky Bulv.,
Kyiv, Ukraine, 01133
Phone: +38 044 581 85 35
Fax: +38 044 581 85 42
giz-ukraine@giz.de

PAUCI, Polish-Ukrainian Cooperation Foundation
+38 (044) 465-64-45 | pauci.kp@gmail.com | pauci.org